

Report of the Director

MULTI-STORY CAR PARK

1 Purpose of report

To provide an update to members on the multi-story car park project and seek a decision on how to progress this project to the next stage.

2 Executive summary

The report provides an update in relation to the ongoing multi-story car park project and the options for how to progress with this project. The options include do nothing, progress with current budget, progress with the necessary works or progress with the necessary works and additional works.

3 Appendices

Appendix 1 – Cost Plan

4 Proposed action:

The committee is invited to RESOLVE to approve:

- (i) Option 4 parts A to E - Progress with necessary work and additional items - described in paragraphs 6.6 and 6.7 of the report and further detailed in Appendix 1 attached at an estimated total cost of £5,352,944; and**
- (ii) the inclusion of additional resources of £2,326,269 to the current capital programme to enable completion of this project**

5 Background

5.1 The funding for the Multi-story car park project approved at Resources Committee on 19 June 2019 was £2,766,675 and was based on a report by consultants Curtins. Following a further update of this report in September 2019 an increase to £3,026,675 was approved at Resources Committee on 25 September 2019.

5.2 Morgan Sindall (MS) were appointed to deliver this project and procured a number of surveys including detailed concrete surveys in order to allow a more accurate estimate of the cost of these works. This review has confirmed that the estimated budget of £3,026,675 did not include sufficient allowance for design and project management fees and following further surveys identified that the costs for some of the repairs are estimated to be higher than

before as the areas needing attention have increased.

- 5.3** This has allowed a detailed specification to be drafted and three quotes have been sought for each of the elements which has identified a cost of £4,298,759 for the essential works (including sprinklers).
- 5.4** MS have advised that the increased costs are predominantly due to the size (area and depth) of the concrete repairs which has added to the cost of the project circa £473k with a further cost of circa £97k for design fees, project management fees and contingency.
- 5.5** MS have interrogated the surveys and have summarised the costs for the project in Appendix 1. The figures have been scrutinised and quotes sought by MS, who have experience of developing car parks, to identify this cost which they feel is appropriate.
- 5.6** As part of the discussions regarding the refurbishment of the car park there has been liaison between officers, Wellingborough Norse, the police and the owners of the Swansgate Centre. This has identified a number of additional items that would help to improve the car park safety, reduce anti-social behavior and generally improve the environment within the car park and Swansgate Centre. These additional items include:
- Full male and female toilet refurbishment (only a small cost was originally included for decorating)
 - Lift survey.
 - Lift lobby refurbishments.
 - Door refurbishments (stairs and lobby's).
 - Lighting and security to stairwells.
 - ANPR cameras and barriers (provision for future install only).
 - Office refurbishment.
 - Associated fees and inflation.
- 5.6** As identified above in order to progress with this refurbishment further consideration is needed on how to proceed. This has meant the start date has had to be delayed from February. Once a decision is made work would be able to start in March 2020, which would mean that works are anticipated to take until the end of December 2020 or January 2021. We would ensure through the phasing of this work that no major works are done in December and that sufficient parking is available throughout the project.

6 Discussion

- 6.1** As identified above due to the increased funding required to undertake the necessary repairs a decision is needed on how to proceed with this project. Identified below are the options for going forward.

Option 1 – Do not progress this project further

- 6.2 This option would be to not progress with the project any further and return the remaining budget into the capital programme. The current cost of work to date for project management, design and surveys is £111,808. This option is not recommended.

Option 1 – Do not progress this project further	
Pros	Cons
No additional capital funding required.	Reputational damage for not completing a council priority project as identified.
	The structural issues of the car park would not be addressed in particular in relation to the concrete.
	The environmental, security and safety issues would still remain and need to be addressed in other ways.
	The cost of repairs would continue to increase and more major repairs would be needed, including reactive repairs..
	The multi-story car park refurbishment is a key element to deliver the town centre vision which would not be achieved if this work is not carried out.

Option 2 – Progress with a partial scheme within budget

- 6.3 This option would be to progress with the funding that is currently allocated which would mean that works to floors 2,3 and 4 are undertaken as the scheme needs to be completed from the top down with floor 3 being important as the access to the Swansgate. This would mean that the first floor and the ground floor (entrance) would not be completed. The cost of this would be £3,026,675. This option is not recommended.

Option 2 – Progress with £3.02m scheme	
Pros	Cons
No additional capital funding required.	Can only deliver floors 3,2 and 1. The ground floor (entrance) could not be undertaken.
	The perception would be that the car park is unfinished or hadn't been improved.
	Removing some levels from the scheme would mean that the security, lighting and safety issues would not be able to be completed on the improved floors, as lights, doors and cameras would not be

	upgraded. This would mean that the car park could not be awarded a safer parking award and ASB would still continue in the unimproved areas.
	Reputational damage for not completing a council priority project as identified.
	The structural issues of the car park would not be addressed in particular in relation to the concrete.

Option 3 – Progress with necessary works

- 6.4** The items that were included in the necessary works including repairs and refurbishment of all levels, signs, markings, sprinklers, stairwells, fire alarms, installation of five charging points, removal of concrete kerbs and preliminary costs for construction.
- 6.5** Total cost of Option 3 is £4,298,759 (including sprinklers) with 10% contingency the cost would be £4,728,635. This option includes essential works and is strongly recommended as an absolute minimum.

Option 3 – Progress with necessary works	
Pros	Cons
The essential elements of the car park would be completed, improving the car park environment and safety.	The wider elements would not be undertaken therefore items like the toilet would be decorated but little more than that.
The car park could be awarded a safer parking award.	Extra costs compared to current capital allocation
The structural issues of the car park would be addressed.	
This priority project would be delivered.	

Option 4 – Progress with necessary works and additional items

- 6.6** While works are being undertaken on the car park it is suggested that wider works are considered. This will allow other environmental and security issues to be addressed in particular the toilet refurbishments, lift improvements and further lighting. This would improve the whole experience for users and is something that has been raised by the police, the Swansgate Centre and Wellingborough Norse. These additional items are estimated to cost around £568,000 and include:
- 6.7**
- Full male and female toilet refurbishment. (a small cost originally included for decorating).
 - Lift survey.

- Lift lobby refurbishments.
- Door refurbishments (stairs and lobby's).
- Lighting and security to stairwells.
- ANPR cameras and barriers (provision for future install).
- Office refurbishment.
- Associated fees and inflation.

Option 4 parts A, C and D are strongly recommended for inclusion in the project. Parts B and E are optional, but are recommended for inclusion to complete the project and to make most cost effective use of the council's capital investment. Option 4 parts A to E inclusive is the option recommended by officers.

As part of this review options have been considered in more detail and identified in Appendix 1.

Option 4 – Progress with necessary works and additional items	
Pros	Cons
The essential elements of the car park would be completed, improving the car park environment and safety.	Extra costs compared to current capital allocation
The wider elements would address further security issues related to the toilets.	
The car park could be awarded a safer parking award.	
The structural issues of the car park would be addressed.	
This priority project would be delivered.	

The costs for each of the sub-options are identified in Appendix 1 and summarised below:

Option 4a - Necessary works plus ANPR camera and full toilet refurbishment - £4,580,823.06 + 10% contingency = £5,038,905.37

Option 4b – Necessary works plus ANPR cameras, full toilet refurbishment and car park office refurbishment - £4,624,881.14 + 10% contingency = £5,087,369.25

Option 4c - Necessary works plus ANPR cameras, full toilet refurbishment, car park office refurbishment and lift lobby refurbishment - £4,756,550.18 + 10% contingency = £ 5,232,205.18

Option 4d - Necessary works plus ANPR cameras, full toilet refurbishment, car park office refurbishment, lift lobby refurbishment and stairwell lighting - £4,822,194.41 + 10% contingency = £ 5,304,413.81

Option 4e - Necessary works plus ANPR cameras, full toilet refurbishment, car park office refurbishment, lift lobby refurbishment and stairwell lighting and door refurbishments - £4,866,357.9 + 10% contingency = £5,352,944

7 Legal powers

The council has full power to manage its property assets under the incidental powers in section 111 of the Local Government Act 1972. Furthermore, the council has all the powers of an individual under section 1 of the Localism Act 2011. Accordingly, it has full power to carry out the proposed actions.

8 Financial and value for money implications

8.1 It was estimated in 2019 that the cost for a new car park would be £15m. There would also be significant additional costs to provide temporary car parking while constructing a new car park.

8.2 The estimated costs of the options are identified in section 6 above and the additional capital investment for each of these options is identified below:

Option	Cost	Additional funding
Option 1	£111,808	Funding of £2,914,867 returned to capital programme
Option 2	£3,026,675	Only partial project
Option 3	£4,728,635	£1,701,960
Option 4a	£5,038,905.37	£2,012,230.37
Option 4b	£5,087,369.25	£2,060,694.25
Option 4c	£5,232,205.18	£2,205,530.18
Option 4d	£5,304,413.81	£2,277,738.81
Option 4e	£5,352,994	£2,326,319

9 Risk analysis

9.1 The risks of each option are identified above, however the main risk is one of inaction. Either no repair work or insufficient repair work will result in the car park having to be closed and demolished within a few years. In that event, the cost of replacing the lost car parking provision would exceed the cost of the full refurbishment. Disruption to businesses in the town centre would be a significant risk if the car park had to close, either permanently or during reconstruction.

9.2 Because of the need for additional funding there is a risk that any works agreed would not be completed by the end of November 2020. It is however anticipated that the majority of work could be completed and smaller works completed early in 2021 to ensure there is minimal impact over the Christmas period.

9.3 The delivery of property related projects, involves risks affecting the timing and delivery of outcomes. Project management techniques identify and manage those risks where possible. However, risks that are wholly in the

control of a third party can be difficult to mitigate.

10 Implications for resources

10.1 Officer resources are in place to deliver this project. External specialist consultants have been procured to support officers in the Property and Projects team. Additional resources, either internal or external, will be procured to support this project if necessary.. If additional permanent or fixed term resources are required to enhance the team a further report will be brought to the committee.

11 Implications for equalities, and stronger and safer communities

There are no direct implications for equalities, or stronger and safer communities. The works in the car park are being undertaken to ensure the car park is accessible as possible for all and to meet the Safer car parking scheme.

12 Author and contact officer

Adrian Piper, Assistant Director (Corporate Landlord)
Victoria Phillipson, Principal Property and Projects Manager

13 Consultees

Liz Elliott, Managing Director
Shaun Darcy, Director
Eric Symons, Assistant Director
Vicki Jessop, Assistant Director
Karen Denton, Assistant Director

14 Background papers

Documentation in relation to works identified and the costs.

KEY:

	Not a recommended or viable option
	Essential, strongly recommended
	Optional, strongly recommended, large benefit to scheme
	Optional recommended

Revised Funding Options			
Option - Description	Scope of Work Included	Cost (£)	Comments
Option 1 - Do Nothing	Pay for remaining design works / surveys / pre-construction costs / fees and any associated abortive costs for stopping the process.	£111,808.37	Not advised owing to condition of car park, will become unsafe and unuseable resulting in demolition. Possible reputational damage to Council with lack of car parking facilities. Current expenditure would not represent Value for Money if work not undertaken, surveys and work undertaken to date will not be useable by others.
Option 2 - Progress & undertake works to current budget	Carry out all necessary concrete repair works as detailed in the Birmingham City labs report. Apply waterproofing system to all decks, new bay markings to levels 2,3 & 4. Apply corrosion control to decks/repairs to levels 2,3 & 4.	£3,028,600	This is not a viable option as it means that only levels 2,3&4 would be repaired. The sequence of works means we work top down and the roof level repairs must done to drastically reduce the amount of water ingress into the car park. Therefore, the two floors with the most need for repair (Ground Floor and Level 1) would not get repaired. Additionally the waterproofing, lighting, cctv system would only be part upgraded and you would not be able to provide the sprinkler system.
Option 3 - Carry out all necessary concrete repair works, cathodic protection to all levels as required and detailed in the Birmingham City labs report.	Carry out all necessary concrete repair works, as detailed in the Birmingham City labs report. Apply waterproofing system to all decks, apply corrosion control to all decks and concrete repairs, new bay markings. Strip out existing mastic and repalce with new at aprapet level. Provide full sprinkler coverage. Strip out existing lighting, CCTV, Fire Alarm and replace with new. Repaint walls, columns and soffits of car park (Internal) Install Electric Vehicle charging points New signage Remove concrete kerbs to access ramps, key clamp, armco and replace as drawings	£4,728,635.00	Works meet brief and will provide fully functional car park with a much improved environment with suitable lighting for the public. Easier wayfinding and enhanced environment. Increased security capabilities with CCTV. Extends the current life expectancy of the car park. Significnatly enhanced fire protection measures with fire alarm and sprinklers, should lower insurance premiums and provide assurance to general public using facility.
Option 4A - as per option 3 + ANPR camera / barriers + Full toilet refurbishment	Car Park Carry out all necessary concrete repair works, as detailed in the Birmingham City labs report. Apply waterproofing system to all decks, apply corrosion control to all decks and concrete repairs, new bay markings. Strip out existing mastic and repalce with new at aprapet level. Provide full sprinkler coverage. Strip out existing lighting, CCTV, Fire Alarm and replace with new. Repaint walls, columns and soffits of car park (Internal) Install Electric Vehicle charging points New signage Remove concrete kerbs to access ramps, key clamp, armcoand replace as drawings. ANPR Installation of ANPR Barriers / Camera's and associated infrastructure / external works Toilets Demolition of existing partition separating toilets to lobby. Strip out existing; M&E, IPS, FF&E, Flooring, wall tiling. New full height stud partitions in new locations. Skim and paint walls Ceramic Tiling Vinyl floor and coved skirting New doors New IPS New M&E (exposed) New mirrors New sanitaryware. 10% contingency	£5,038,905.37	As option 3 + Full facilities / capability to use Automatic Number Plate Recognition technology to futureproof operation of the car park. Useable, functional, vandal resistant toilet facilities for use by general public.

Option 4 B - as per option 4A + car park Office refurbishment	Office Refurbishment Strip out existing; M&E, FF&E, Flooring. Skim and paint, walls and soffit. New Vinyl floor. Prepare and make good doors. Prepare and make good windows. New sanitaryware. New M&E (exposed) New worktop and base units. Remove 2no. external roller shutters to stores, and infill with brickwork to match existing. 10% contingency	£5,087,369.25	As Option 4A + Fully functional office for staff to run car park facilities from, will be required to monitor cctv from, equipment storage and to enable possible future changes to how the car park is managed
Option 4C - as per option 4A + Lift Lobby refurbishment	Lift Lobby Strip out existing; M&E, FF&E, Flooring. New vinyl floor, and entrance matting. Make good walls, ceilings, and redecorate. New M&E (exposed). Redecorate doors (to car park) Make good and decorate window frames and boards 10% contingency	£5,232,205.18	As 4A + Suitable transition space between the Car Park and shopping centre provided making it a more pleasant environment and experience for customers
Option 4D - as 4C + Stairwell lighting	Stairwell lighting Strip out existing; M&E, FF&E, Flooring. New vinyl floor, and entrance matting. Make good walls, ceilings, and redecorate. New M&E (exposed). Redecorate doors (to car park) Make good and decorate window frames and boards 10% contingency	£5,304,413.81	As 4C + Useable staircases with suitable environment for general public (painting works are included in option 3 above)
Option 4E - as 4D + Door refurbishments	Door refurbishments Strip out existing; M&E, FF&E, Flooring. New vinyl floor, and entrance matting. Make good walls, ceilings, and redecorate. New M&E (exposed). Redecorate doors (to car park) Make good and decorate window frames and boards 10% contingency	£5,352,944.00	As 4D + Full scope of works mean car park and all associated spaces are upgraded and will be a fully functional enhanced environment for general public to use and encourage them to use the shopping centre.